HCIR Lab Seminar

Digital Twin of Wireless Systems: Overview, Taxonomy, Challenges, and Opportunities.

Latif U. Khan , Zhu Han , Fellow, IEEE, Walid Saad , Fellow, IEEE, Ekram Hossain , Fellow, IEEE, Mohsen Guizani , Fellow, IEEE, and Choong Seon Hong , Senior Member, IEEE

Sofanit Wubeshet Beyene 2023-03-13

Dept. of Computer Science and Engineering



Contents

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Digital twin: Concept, Key design aspects, and Frameworks
- 3. Taxonomy: Twins for wireless

- A. Market Statistics and research trends
- **B.** Existing surveys and tutorials

- Future wireless services will have to play a key role in improving the quality of various applications such as brain-computer interaction, flying vehicles, and extended reality (XR), among others.
- These applications will have diverse performance requirements (e.g., user-defined quality of experience metrics, latency, and reliability) which will be challenging to be fulfilled by existing wireless systems.
- To meet the diverse requirements of the emerging applications, the concept of digital twins has been recently proposed.
- A digital twin uses a virtual representation along with security-related technologies (e.g., blockchain), communication technologies (e.g., 6G), computing technologies (e.g., edge computing), and machine learning, so as to enable the smart applications.

- These new technologies will enable the wireless systems to meet the diverse requirements via enabling two main trends:
 - Self-configuring wireless systems
 - Proactive-online-learning-enabled systems
- To design a self-configuring and proactive-online-learning enabled wireless system, digital twin can be used to represent the wireless system.
- A digital twin takes inputs from a real world and makes predictions and/or control decisions. For this, in addition to the virtual representation of a wireless system, a digital twin-based wireless system will use tools from optimization theory, game theory, and machine learning.
- Additionally, to enable transparent and immutable handling of data, a digital twin-based system will use blockchain.

- A digital twin is different from traditional simulation tools, as it can use realtime (i.e., actual) data generated at the sensors attached to the physical objects and run simulations and analysis for online control of wireless systems.
- The two-way flow of information between the twin and the sensors can increase the accuracy of predictive analytical models.
- Hence, digital twin provides a more general platform for simulations and decision making.

• Conceptual overview of a digital twin for a wireless system.



- A. Market Statistics and Research Trends
 - **The Internet of Things (IoT) market** will grow at a Compound Annual Growth Rate (CAGR) of 26.9% during the period of 2017-2022. The market share will grow from 170.6 Billion USD in 2017 to 561.0 Billion USD in 2022.
 - This is mainly due to an increase in the IoT market for smart buildings, smart grids, smart industries, and intelligent transportation.
 - The key market players in the digital twin market are:
 - General Electric (U.S.), Bosch Software Innovation GmbH (Stuttgart, Germany), Amazon Web Services Inc. (U.S.), Hewlett-Packard Enterprise (U.S.), Google Inc. (U.S.), PTC Inc, International Business Machine (IBM) Corporation (U.S.), Oracle Corporation (U.S.), Microsoft Corporation (U.S.), Cisco Systems, Inc. (U.S.), SAP SE (Walldorf, Germany), and Intel Corporation (U.S.).

- A. Market Statistics and Research Trends
 - According to statistics of Markets and Markets, *the market of digital twins* will grow at a CAGR rate of 58% during the period of 2020-2026.
 - The market value of digital twin in 2020 was 3.1 Billion USD and it will reach 48.2 Billion USD by 2026.
 - Due to the increasing importance of digital twins in the development of smart applications, various countries, such as Brazil, Norway, Mexico, China, Japan, South Korea, and Singapore, are trying to implement twin-based systems.
 - The key market players in the digital twin market are:
 - SWIM.AI (USA), Robert Bosch (Germany), ANSYS (USA), Siemens AG (USA), Oracle (USA), SAP (Germany), Microsoft Corporation (USA), PTC (USA), IBM (USA), and General Electric (USA).

- A. Market Statistics and Research Trends
 - On the other hand, the number of publications for digital twin and IoT also shows a significant increase.



B. Existing Surveys and Tutorials

SUMMARY OF EXISTING SURVEYS AND TUTORIALS AND THEIR PRIMARY FOCUS

Reference	Wireless twins	for Twins for wire- less	Taxonomy	Remark
Minerva et al. [13]	X	×	X	This survey comprehensively presents technical fea- tures, scenarios and architectural models for digital twins in the context of IoT.
Wu et al. [14]	1	×	×	This survey presents the twin fundamentals, as well as key enabling technologies, and open challenges.
Barricelli et al. [15]	×	×	×	This paper presents the fundamentals, implementa- tion details, and applications of digital twins.
Yaqoob <i>et al.</i> [16]	×	×	×	The authors discuss the role of blockchain on en- abling digital twins. Also, a taxonomy is devised.
Suhail <i>et al</i> . [17]	×	×	×	Blockchain-based twins are discussed. Furthermore, research trends and future directions are presented.
Khan <i>et al.</i> [5]	×	1	X	This tutorial presents the key design requirements, architectural trends, and future directions for digital-twin-enabled 6G.
Our Tutorial	1	1	1	Comprehensively discusses issues for designing dig- ital twins for wireless systems and also optimizing wireless communications for digital twins.

- A. Concept
- **B.** Design aspects
- C. High-level architecture
- D. Frameworks
- E. Example scenario.
- F. Summary and lessons learned

- A. Concepts
 - A digital twin is a virtual representation of the physical system serving as a digital counterpart.
 - The main purpose of a digital twin is to jointly optimize the cost and performance of a system or overall process using various emerging technologies (e.g., virtual modeling, simulation technologies, blockchain, edge computing, cloud computing) and optimization tools.
 - Digital twin provides proactive analysis of the physical process using various simulation tools (e.g., AMEsim, SimScale, Simulink), artificial intelligence, mathematical optimization, game theory, and graph theory, among others.

A. Concepts

• Digital Twin Categories

DIGITAL T	WIN	CATEGORIES:	SOURCE.	TYPE.	AND	EXPLANATION

	Reference	Category (defined by source)	Description by the source	Key objective	\frown
Semens [2] by varying differences in a advise of numfacturing process components are tested for poment in real-time deployment. This with in the deploses component is a set of the deployment of a system operational data. This was also components are tested for poment in real-time deployment of a system operational data. This was also components are tested for poments are tested for poment in real-time deployment. This was also components are tested for poments are tested for poment in real-time deployment. This was also components are tested for poments are tested for poment in real-time deployment. This was also and performance data data can be further induces to enhance the twin performance. This was also do ther tech-induces or adapticate twins and a single component in a single system. This win all can and performance. This was also do ther tech-induces or adapticate wins and a single component in a single component in a single or many wins in a complex system. (e.g., for short and addition-induces the twin for forming the deployment in a single component in		Product digital twin		New product design	Network
Production digital twin by varying different system parameters to analyze the cost and performance for a new product before it is actually mainfactured. Efficient deployment of system Production digital twin Digital veins or supposentia are tested on performance and cost. This will lead to efficient deployment of system Efficient deployment of system Performance digital twin To use a digital twin or supposentia and efficient deployment. Data analysis for performance endities or supposentia are tested on an efficient way to optimize the cost and performance the twin will lead to strain the option of a single entity. Data analysis for performance endities way to optimize the cost and performance testes and efficient deployment. Modeling of a single entity. Vereator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin feers to a twin for optimized use of na away tooks of a digital twin that is made to optimized use of a digital twin twins. Modeling of a single entity. Performance optimization of a condition in gasystem in a samat home) of a system. Tribucel. [26] Component twin This twin feers to a twin for optimized use of a digital twin that is made up of multiple component in a single component. Single system ceg. Single system performance trip system system devices management/ network functions Tribucel. [26] Twin entity Twin entity e system system feermanaly th	Siemens [23]				
before it is actually manufactured. Efficient deployment of system Production digital twin Dues a digital twin for capturing and cating on ponents in relation deployment. Efficient deployment of system Performance digital twin To use a digital twin for capturing and cating on ponent in relation deployment. Data analysis for performance of the perfo					device /
Production digital twin To use a digital twin in the process of manufacturing. Digital twins of various components are tested performance and cost. This will lead to efficient selection/placement of manufacturing process com- ponent in real-time deployment. Data analysis for performance or performance and cost. This will enable smart plants (e.g., smart grid, smart industry) to operate in mace. Data analysis for performance or performance and (e.g., smart grid, smart industry) to operate in mace. Data analysis for performance or performance and cost. This will enable smart plants (e.g., smart grid, smart industry) to operate in mace. Data analysis for performance or ponent that is made of findividual entities (e.g., leasting or formance. twins) Data analysis for performance or performance or ponent that is made of findividual entities (e.g., cart wins and struct dusting of complex system. This treffers to a twin for ophilize twins dust with models dust with model shee of a duplicate twins and entities (e.g., cart wins and struct dusting of complex system. This twin faces to the virtual models of a duplicate twins and with model shee component that entities system formance of a duplicate twins and with models the entities (e.g., antononous car engine). Performance or performance of a component that is made of manty twins in a component that is made of manty twins in a component. Wireless system devices management/ network functions Tributech [26] Component twin Esset twin This twin fuele process facility (e.g., antononous car plant). Single system <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>Edge</td></t<>					Edge
Digital twins of various components are tested for performance and cost. This will lead to filter the deployment. components Performance digital twin To use a digital twin for capturing and acting on operational data. This with lead to entry the cost and performance by using the generated data. This data can be further used by machine learning models and other techning uses to enhance the twin performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the cost and performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win performance. Data analysis for performance optimized use of multiple to the win for optimized use of multiple to the win for optimized use of multiple to the wins and smart industry to on a system. Performance optimization of a complex system. Performance optimization of a complex system. Performance optimization of a system. Single specific components. This twin seles to multiple component twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Single specific components. This twin actes by covering a large system. This twin nodels the entire process facility (e.g., attributenol cag). Single specific component.					
Performance digital twin Performance digital twin Due a digital twin for operational data. This twin will enable smart plants (e.g., smart digital twin for exporting and a dring operational data. This twin will enable smart plants (e.g., smart digital twin for exporting and a dring on operational data. This twin will enable smart plants (e.g., smart twin digital twin for exporting and a dring of performance wins) Data analysis for performance enhancement Vereator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin refers to the virtual models of individual stant home) of a system. Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This twin statics, and ir consola cale that modeling of complex system that have above acale that modeling of complex system that have above acale that modeling of complex system that have above acale that twin based and third regression a single component in a system. Single system (e.g., 6G-based and twin trepresents a single component in a system. Tribuech [26] Component twin Such a twin that are manage the system that is made up of multiple component in a system. Single system (e.g., 6G-based and twing trepresents and twing the system optimized use of nultiple components. Single system (e.g., 6G-based and twing the system optimated as to in that is made to twing system at anta that have a basels by covering a large system (e.g., 6G-based and simple alerting system. Single system (e.g., 6G-based and simple alerting system for twin basels by covering a large system (e.g., 6G-based and simple alerting system for the system for mance on twing the system for antat tweel by another the system for twing system models in a single component. Single system for a si		Production digital twin			management End-to-end Single entity
Performance digital twin Dis us a digital twin for capturing and scing on periodic nucleus of the cost and performance or periodic nucleus of the cost and performance or busing the generated data. This twin will enable small models and other techningues to enhance the twin performance. This twin refers to the twin for opinized to generational models and and are twin the system metrice autonomous car opinization of a single entity. entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air condition-ing system twin as smart hood of a system. Modeling of a single entity. entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air condition-ing system twin as smart hood of a system. Performance optimization of a single entity. entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air condition-ing system twin sin a smart hood of a system. Performance optimization of a single entity. entities (e.g., cart twin and smart industry twins in a complex system. Duplicated digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex system. Performance optimization of a duplicate twin single specific components in an stand-hone twins (e.g., GE-based that have a broad scale than those of a duplicate twin single specific components in a system. Single specific components. Tributeh [26] Component twin System wink (e.g., for twin tke (e.g., autonomous car). Single system Single system Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car). Single system Single system Single system Process twin This twin is used to monitor the system performance win situation and growide insights intof ture states. Single system performance win mace.				components	IoE service
ponent in real-time deployment. New colspan="2">New colspan="2">Digital twin Performance digital twin To use a digital twin in cables mart plata. Data analysis for performance enhance the twin bancement bancement bancement bancement Vercator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple Modeling of a single entity. Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple Performance optimized use of a duplicat twin. Modeling of a single entity. New complex system. District with single component that is made of many twins. Thib twin refers to a twin for optimized use of a duplicat twin. Performance of a cuplicate digital twin. Modeling of complex system. Modeling of a single entity. New complex system. District with single component in a system. Tributech [26] Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in a system. Single specific component is a system. System multiple component twins (e.g., dash- autonomous car) plant). System twin with work functions System twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car) plant). Single system To monitor the phenomenon. System multiple components. XMPRO [24] Status twin <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
Performance digital twin To use a digital twin for capturing and acting on operational data. This twin will enables mant plants (e.g., smart grid, smart industry) to operate in an efficient way to optimize the cost and other techning models and other techning models and other techning models and other techning models and other techning system in a smart home) of a system. Data analysis for performance enhancement Standalone digital twin This twin refers to the virtual models of individual models of a single entity. Modeling of a single entity. Resource Multiple loE Network planning. Vercator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin and smart industry twins and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a system. Resource Multiple loE Network planning. Duplicated digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex system. To enhance the performance of a component in an assmart surveillance in a city). Single specific component in a system. To enhance the performance of a component in an assmart surveillance in a city). System multiple component it wins (e.g., Got based smart surveillance in a system. To sease twins Twin entity Wireless system devices management/ network functions Tributech [26] Component twin Statu stwin models the entire process facility (e.g., attors monous care) plann). Single system System multiple component. System multiple component. System with plant XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin models the cominer performance vin multiple susto in					New Digital Cloud
Performance diginal torm Process twin Process twin Process twin Data a diginal torm D				-	Digital
Kerster (c.g., smart grid, smart industry) to operate in an efficient way to optimize the cost and performance. Modeling of a single entity. Vercator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple component tak is made of many twins). Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This twin a smart home) of a system. Performance optimization of a complex system. Resource Multiple IoF, Network, planning, isolated and the twin performance optimization of a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin a smart home) of a system. Performance optimization of a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin a deals with modeling of complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. Tributech [26] Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in a system. System multiple component is a system. Tributech [26] Asset twin This twin acles by covering a large system (e.g., disher bert process facility (e.g., autonomous car plan). System multiple component is a system. Single system. MURPRO [24] Status twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plan). To monitor the phenomenon. To analyze the system performance. Ample (24) Status twin This twin is used to monifor the system sets and corrent with the system core the system system. To enhaltic pont/ont the syste		Performance digital twin			service
 efficient way to optimize the cost and performance by using the general data. This data can be further used by machine learning models and other tech- niques to enhance the twin performance. Standalone digital twin This twin refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin This twin seless to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin This twin seless to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin This twin seless to a twin that can manage the system. System twin System twin This twin seless by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car). System twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car). This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car ar gine). Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car plant). Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car plant). This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car plant). This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., autonomous car plant). This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash- atimulation and provide insights into future states. This twin is used to monitor the system monitor the system. This twin is used to monitor the system monito				hancement	twins
by using the generated data. This data can be further used by machine learning models and other tech- niques to enhance the twin performance. Wereator [25] Vereator [25] Mereator digital twin metrics (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air condition- ing system in a smart home) of a system. Duplicated digital twin metrics (e.g., early wins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin microsoft win for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin microsoft win for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Enhanced digital twin microsoft win the als with modeling of complex systems that have a broad scale than those of a duplicate twin and will consist of multiple duplicate twins and uncomosus car engine). System twin entire autonomous car engine). System twin metwork functions that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). XMPRO [24] Status twin MMPRO [24] Simulation twin is ured to monitor the system, entire autonomous car of a large system). To analyze the system performance, simulation and provide insights into future states. Operational twin it readbles us a nalyze the system performance. To analyze the system, control the system, of operational twin iteract with the system approximates. To analyze the system. To efficiently control the system, the system future states. To analyze the system performance.					
used by machine learning models and other techning models of individual entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air conditioning system in a system. Modeling of a single entity. Vercator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin refers to the virtual models of individual entities (e.g., trating, ventilation, and air conditioning system in a system. Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple system. Performance optimization of a complex system. component that is made of many twins in a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin neelses with modeling of complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. Tributech [26] Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an entire system. Single specific components. that is made up of multiple duplicate twin that is made up of multiple components. that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car). System multiple components. that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car). System multiple components. that is made up of multiple system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting system). To monitor the phenomenon. boards and simple alerting system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting system). To monitor the phenomenon. boards and simple alerting system performance. To analyze the system performance. To analyze the system performance. To analyze the system performance. Simulation twin It readbes us analyze the					
Image: Indigues to enhance the twin performance. Vercator [25] Standalone digital twin This twin refers to the virtual models of individual ing system in a smart home) of a system. Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a complex system. Resource Multiple IoF Network services Enhanced digital twin This twin refers to a twin thooplicate twins. To openance the performance of a complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. Tributech [26] Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an single specific components. that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). Single specific components. term. Single system Asset twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car engine). Single system Single system XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system, boards and simple alerting systems). To manize the system performance via simulation and provide insights into frue states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system actoortrol the system. To analyze the system. To analyze the system.					
Standalone digital twin This twin refers to the virtual models of individual entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air condition- ing system in a smart home) of a system. Modeling of a single entity. Modeling of a single entity. Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins in a complex system. Performance of a many twins in a complex system. Performance of a tomponent that is made of many twins in a complex system. No enhace the performance of a twins in a complex system. Solated service Component twin Such a twin referes to a twin that can manage the system that is made up of multiple duplicate twins entire system. Single specific component in a system multiple component is tem. System multiple component is entire system. System Single system Tributech [26] System twin This twin is calse by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car engine). Single system Single system To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin is used to nomitor the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system perfor- mance. To analyze the system. To analyze the system. </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
Vercator [25] entities (e.g., heating, ventilation, and air conditioning system. Performance optimization of a component that is made of mant twins in a complex system. Performance optimization of a complex system. Services Network planning Enhanced digital twin This refers to a twin for ooptimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a complex system. To enhance the performance of a twin sin a complex system. To enhance the performance of a duplicate twin and will consist of multiple duplicate twin. Single specific component in a system. Single specific component in a system. Single specific component is a system (e.g., Gb-based smart surveillance in a city). Single specific components. Single specific components. Network functions Tributech [26] Component twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., dash- etc.) Single system System multiple components. Single system Single system Entire plant autonomous car plant). This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., dash- etc.) To monitor the system (e.g., dash- etc.) Twin entity Wireless system (e.g., dash- etc.) System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., dash- etc.) Entire plant To analyze the system perf		Standalana digital twin		Madalina of a single antity	D Multiple LeE
Image: system in a smart home) of a system. Image: system in a smart home) of a system. Performance optimization of a system. Image: system in a smart home) of a system. Image: Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple trans and shore twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a component that is made of many twins in a complex system. Image: component twin service. Image: component twins service. Image: component. Image: component. Image: component. Image: component. Image: component. <td>Variator [25]</td> <td>Standarone digitar twin</td> <td></td> <td>Modeling of a single entity.</td> <td>- INCLWOIK</td>	Variator [25]	Standarone digitar twin		Modeling of a single entity.	- INCLWOIK
Duplicated digital twin This refers to a twin for optimized use of multiple stand-alone twins (e.g., car twin and smart industry twins). Performance optimization of a component that is made of many twins in a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex systems that have a broad scale than those of a duplicate twins. To enhance the performance of a complex system. Legends Twin entity Legends Twin entity Legends Twin entity Twin entity Network functions Tributech [26] System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., entite autonomous car). Single system To monitor the phenomenon. Single system system performance of a anylyze the system performance of a anylyze the system performance. To analyze the system performance. To an	vercator [25]				slicing services planning
stand-alone twins (e.g., car twins and smart industry twins). component that is made of many twins in a complex system. component that is made of many twins in a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. To enhance the performance of a complex system. Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an will consist of multiple duplicate twins. Single specific component in a system. Twin entity Wireless system devices management/ network functions Tributech [26] Asset twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car engine). Single system Single system System twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car engine). Entire plant To monitor the phenomenon. Single system To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Status twin It enables us analyze the system system performance via manage the system of the system of the system management with the system performance trance. To analyze the system performance via management.		Duplicated digital twin		Performance optimization of a	-
Image: construct twins). twins in a complex system. Enhanced digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex systems and will consist of multiple duplicate twins. To enhance the performance of a city. Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an will consist of multiple duplicate twins. Single specific component in a system. Tributeh [26] Asset twin This refers to a twin that can manage the system that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). System twin entire autonomous car. System twin This twin sodels the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car.) Single system (e.g., dash-twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant XMPRO [24] Status twin Th enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. To analyze the system. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system. To efficiently control the system.		Duplicated digital twill			Industry
Enhanced digital twin This twin deals with modeling of complex systems that have a broad scale than those of a duplicate twin. To enhance the performance of a complet system (e.g., 6G-based smart surveillance in a city). Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an entire system. Single specific component in a system. Asset twin This twin addu p of multiple duplicate twins. Single system (e.g., 6G-based smart surveillance in a city). Asset twin This refers to a twin that can manage the system that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). System multiple components. System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car). Single system Process twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash autonomous car plant). To monitor the phenomenon. boards and simple alerting systems). To analyze the system performance via manage. XMPRO [24] Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. operational twin To efficiently control the system. To efficiently control the system.					
that have a broad scale than those of a duplicate twin and will consist of multiple duplicate twins. Tributech [26] Component twin Tributech [26] Asset twin System twin Process twin MRPRO [24] Status twin XMPRO [24] Coperational twin It enables us analyze the system performance via Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system. Component twin Tributech [26] Component twin Tributech [26] Component twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car engine). System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., entire autonomous car). Frocess twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car plant). To monitor the phenomenon. Coperational twin The transformance via Coperational twin The ables us to interact with the system and control To analyze the system performance. Coperational twin To efficiently control the system. To efficiently control the system.		Enhanced digital twin			
and will consist of multiple duplicate twins. smart surveillance in a city). Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an entire system. Single specific component in a system. Asset twin This refers to a twin that can manage the system that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). System multiple components. System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car). Single system Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car). Entire plant autonomous car plant). XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin suced to monitor the system (e.g., simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance via future states. Operational twin It enables us analyze the system and control To efficiently control the system. To efficiently control the system.					twins
Component twin Such a twin represents a single component in an onterest of a twin represents a single component in a system. Single specific component in a system. Legends Twin entity Tributech [26] Asset twin This refers to a twin that can manage the system that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). System multiple components. System multiple components. Twin entity Wireless system devices management/ network functions System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., autonomous car). Single system Entire plant Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car). Entire plant To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. To enficiently control the system. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system. To efficiently control the system.					
Tributech [26] entire system. tem.		Component twin			Under the Truin antity Wireless system devices management/
Image: state structure that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g., autonomous car engine). Single system System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., entire autonomous car). Single system Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.	Tributech [26]			e i i i	Legends I win entity network functions
autonomous car engine). autonomous car engine). System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., entire autonomous car). Single system Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant XMPRO [24] Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.		Asset twin	This refers to a twin that can manage the system	System multiple components.	
System twin This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g., entire autonomous car). Single system Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.			that is made up of multiple component twins (e.g.,		
Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation autonomous car bit into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.					
Process twin This twin models the entire process facility (e.g., autonomous car plant). Entire plant Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.		System twin	This twin scales by covering a large system (e.g.,	Single system	
Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.					
Status twin This twin is used to monitor the system (e.g., dash-boards and simple alerting systems). To monitor the phenomenon. XMPRO [24] Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.		Process twin	This twin models the entire process facility (e.g.,	Entire plant	•
XMPRO [24] boards and simple alerting systems). Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.					
Simulation twin It enables us analyze the system performance via simulation and provide insights into future states. To analyze the system performance via mance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.		Status twin		To monitor the phenomenon.	8
simulation and provide insights into future states. mance. Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.	XMPRO [24]	a			
Operational twin It enables us to interact with the system and control To efficiently control the system.		Simulation twin			
the system for efficient and cost performance.		Operational twin		To efficiently control the system.	
			the system for efficient and cost performance.		

- A. Concepts
 - The implementation process of a digital twin starts with the analysis of a physical system. Next to physical system analysis, a virtual system is designed that represents the physical system.
 - After virtual modeling, the virtual design needs to be verified by simulating the virtual model and comparing the performance with the physical system.
 - Modeling a virtual system is challenging. The challenges include designing an accurate representation of a system using mathematical equations.



B. Design Aspects

- There are two aspects of the design:
 - Wireless for twin:
 - Deals with the design of twins to enable various network functions/ applications.
 - Twin for wireless
 - Deals with efficient communication methods to enable signaling for implementation of twins.
- A twin-enabled wireless network will have blockchain networks, edge/cloud servers, data decoupling interfaces, function decoupling interfaces, and physical devices to enable the successful operation of IoE services.



B. Design Aspects

- Wireless resources can be used in twinning mainly for two operations:
 - Training of twin objects.
 - Signaling for twin operation.
- Twins training will use wireless resources to transfer data and learning updates.
- For centralized learning, a wireless channel is used to migrate the data from end-devices to the shared storage (i.e., servers installed at the edge/cloud).
- In case the data is enormous (autonomous driving cars), distributed learning (e.g., federated learning [FL]) can be used.
 FL is based on sending only learning model updates rather than the whole data, and thus consumes fewer communication resources compared to centralized learning.

- **B.** Design Aspects
 - To train digital twin models using distributed learning over wireless networks, a significant amount of resources will be required.
 - Variable latencies will be induced for transferring learning model updates between devices and twin model servers.
 - For a twin model update of size u and channel throughput Γ, the transmission latency can be given by d = u/Γ.
 - The transmission latency can be minimized, for example, by reducing the size of twin model updates, and improving the throughput, e.g., by performing efficient association of devices with edge/cloud server and efficient wireless resource allocation.

s a machine learning technique that trains an algorithm across multiple decentralized edge devices or servers holding local data samples, without exchanging them

Wrapping up, we can say that distributed learning is about having centralized data but distributing the model training to different nodes, while federated learning is about having decentralized data and training and in effect having a central model.

C. High-Level Architecture

• High-level architecture of a digital twin for wireless systems based on logical twin objects.



- The services layer contains interfaces for applications. One can request a service from a twin-based wireless system.
- In response to the user request, semantic reasoning schemes are used to translate the request, which is then passed to the twin layer.



- The twin layer contains logical twin objects which use a virtual representation of the physical object/ phenomenon.
- For a digital twin, there can be different models for the physical objects/ phenomenon, such as mathematical model, 3D model, and data-driven model.
- Twin layer objects can be implemented using container/s or virtual machine/s. Also, twin objects can be deployed either at the network edge or at the remote cloud.



- The last layer is the devices' physical interaction layer, which contains all the physical devices, such as end-devices, edge/cloud servers, base stations, miners, and core network switches, among others.
- Effective interfaces are required between different layers of in a twin-based wireless system. These interfaces can be twin-to-physical object interface, twin-to-twin interface, and twin-to-service interface.



- For a digital-twin-enabled wireless system, there are two aspects of reliability:
 - Twin reliability
 - Twin-based service reliability.
- **Twin reliability** refers to the operation of a twin with minimum possible interruption due to the failure of the edge/cloud server running the twin object.
 - An IoT service based on a single twin deployed at the cloud has lower reliability than an IoT service based on multiple twin objects deployed at edge servers. However, the management of multiple twins for a certain service will incur more complexity.
- **Twin service reliability** mainly depends on wireless channel reliability and reliability of edge/cloud computing. Similar to twin signaling, channel coding schemes can be used for this.
 - A digital twin can be used for predictive maintenance of 6G systems to avoid system malfunctions and cyber-attacks through artificial intelligence analytics and simulation.

- Steps for a twin-based wireless system operation
 - The end-user will request a service. This request will be translated using semantic reasoning schemes to make it compatible with the twin object-based architecture.
 - Next, the twin object will be created to serve the end-user.
 - Finally, the twin object uses mathematical optimization and machine learning schemes in addition to virtual representation to enable efficient resource optimization for various services.
 - The twin objects will use pre-trained twin model to serve the requesting user. Meanwhile, the newly generated data may be used by twin object to further train the pre-trained model for performance enhancement. After training, the twin model will be stored using a blockchain network. Finally, after serving the requesting user, the twin objects based on virtual machines/ containers are released.

D. Frameworks

- Frameworks designed for implementing digital twins.
 - Eclipse Ditto: is a framework for creating digital IoT twins. The framework consists of Ditto services (components), external dependencies (MongoDB and nginx), and application programming interfaces (APIs).
 - Model Conductor-eXtended Framework is framework for digital twins experimentation. The framework enables us to co-execute the digital systems and physical systems as well as asynchronous communication. Furthermore, support for machine learning models, customized models, and running FMUs (simulation models packaged according to the FMI specification) is also provided.
 - Mago3D is a digital twin platform developed by Gaia3D Inc.The purpose is to model real-world objects, phenomenon, and processes on Web environment.
 - The platform consists of a geospatial data server, data conversion server, platform core server, and Web server, for realizing the digital twin-based architecture. Mago3D has been applied in various sectors, such as Korean national defense, indoor data management, shipbuilding, and urban management, and has shown good results.

- D. Frameworks
 - All frameworks (i.e., Eclipse Ditto, Model Conductor-eXtended Framework, and Mago3D) are promising for the realization of digital twinbased systems.
 - However, none of them effectively considers the effects of wireless channels on the performance of digital twins.
 - In wireless systems, wireless channel uncertainties will significantly affect the performance of IoT applications.
 - Therefore, these wireless channel uncertainties need to be modeled effectively for digital twinning of wireless systems.

E. Example Scenario

- Consider an XR device that requests a service from the access point.
 - First of all, authentication will be performed by the digital twin-based wireless system at the service layer in response to the end-user request.
 - Next to authentication, a translation scheme will translate the user request into the form understandable by the twin-based wireless system.
 - The next step will be instantiation of the twin object/s. The deployment of twin object/s will be either at the network edge or the cloud depending on the latency constraints.
 - These twin objects should be associated with the blockchain so that twin objects can reuse the pretrained models stored in blockchain.
 - Additionally, the blockchain stores the data required for efficient analysis. To serve the requesting user, twin object/s will use pretrained models in addition to mathematical optimization to perform efficient resource management and other functions, twin control signaling must be efficiently performed.

F. Summary and Lessons learned

- A digital twin should be designed in a generalized way so that it can be easily reusable for future services. Twins based on machine learning should be trained using more data to make them generalized so as to use them for multiple scenarios.
- The current digital twin frameworks are designed without effectively taking into account the wireless channel impairments. Novel frameworks will need to be designed for digital twinning over wireless systems.
- Digital twins for a wireless network can be used for effective use of computing and communication resources and serving users with different requirements ("twin for wireless"). On the other hand, efficient wireless resource management methods will be required for twin signaling ("wireless for twins").

- A. Design of Twin objects
- B. Prototyping of Twin objects
- C. Deployment approaches for Twins

- The taxonomy is divided into two layers, namely, the physical interaction layer and the twin layer.
- The main aspects related to designing twins for wireless systems are identified to be: twin isolation, incentive design, twin object design, twin object prototyping, twin object deployment, physical end-device design, decoupling, and interface design.



- Twin isolation enables the seamless operation of twins for various services without interrupting the performance of each other.
- Twin object design helps in the on-demand creation of twins using existing computing hardware for various applications.
- Twin object prototyping helps in the creation of virtual models of the wireless systems.
- Twin object deployment is about the placement (e.g., cloud or edge) of twin objects.
- Decoupling allows the seamless operation of the twin-based services with minimum possible dependency on the underlying hardware.
- Interfaces are used for various types of communications, such as those among twin objects, and those between twin objects and physical devices. To motivate the participation of different devices in twinning, incentive mechanisms will be required.

A. Design of Twin objects

- There are two ways to instantiate the twin objects, such as virtual machine-based twin objects and container-based twin objects.
- A virtual machine can be defined as the architecture that is independent of the underlying hardware.
- Virtual machines can be mainly of two types, such as system virtual machine and process virtual machine.
- In the context of a twin-based wireless system, the system virtual machine can be used to model a complete IoT service (e.g., AR-based healthcare system), whereas the process virtual machine can be used to model the particular portion (e.g., edge caching module for smart infotainment system) of digital twin-based system.
- Modeling a complete system may be easier than modeling a particular part.

A. Design of Twin objects

- The virtual machine is different from the operating system. In an operating system, language-independent extensions of hardware are created, whereas a virtual machine creates a machine-independent instruction set.
- Virtual machine-based virtualization can be seen as an infrastructure as-a-service (IaaS) that can enable the same hardware via virtualization for running multiple operating systems (e.g., twins).
- This operational approach has the main drawback of high management complexity. To address this issue, container based twin objects can be used. Containers can help minimize management complexity by running multiple twins on the same operating system. However, container-based twin objects may be more prone to security attacks than the virtual machine-based design.

B. Prototyping of Twin objects

- Prototyping twin objects involves estimating the parameters of virtual twin models for the physical system counterparts. True prototyping of twin objects is one of the primary challenges in digital twinning over wireless networks.
- Physical objects are characterized by a set of attributes (e.g., shape, mass, energy). These attributes are difficult to model exactly. In experimental modeling, a series of experiments are performed to find out the various parameters of a physical wireless system.
- Various entities of a wireless system can be modeled using experimental data. Alternatively, mathematical modeling can be used that is based on a mathematical representation of a wireless phenomenon. Typical mathematical models are based on various assumptions that need to be valid for a real-life scenario so that a more practical model of the digital twin can be developed.

B. Prototyping of Twin objects

- There are some scenarios which are difficult to model mathematically. In these scenarios, data-driven modeling can be used.
- Wireless system applications (e.g., XR) can generate a significant amount of data that can be used in modeling their behavior. One can use the data to train machine learning models.
- However, training of a machine learning model within a certain period of time for a certain data set may require a significant amount of computing resource (CPU-cycle/sec).
- An increase in computing resources will minimize the training time but at the cost of an increased energy consumption.

B. Prototyping of Twin objects

- There are two types of machine learning models, namely, centralized machine and distributed machine learning models.
- Centralized machine learning relies on centralized training at the remote cloud or edge server. With centralized machine learning, there is an issue of privacy leakage because of transferring end-devices' data to the centralized cloud/edge server.
- To mitigate this problem, distributed machine learning can be used, in which case the end-devices iteratively train the global model using their local data sets. The local model updates are then sent to the edge/cloud server for aggregation to yield a global model.

- C. Deployment Approaches for Twins
 - Depending on the application requirements, twins can be mainly deployed either at the network edge or cloud.
 - Every application has distinct requirements in terms of latency, quality of physical experience, computing resource requirement, and reliability, among others.
 - Twins deployed at the network edge can enable services with low latency compared to those deployed at the cloud. Also, the twins at the edge can have more context awareness (e.g., locations of end-devices, mobility-awareness).
 - However, the edge-based twins have limitations in terms of low computing resources. When deployed in the cloud, there could be more computing resources.

- C. Deployment Approaches for Twins
 - A hybrid approach can be used in which twins are deployed at both network edge and cloud.
 - For instance, consider the digital-twin-enabled infotainment system for autonomous cars.
 - One can use caching assisted by a hybrid twin that consists of two twins deployed at both the network edge and the cloud.
 - The edge twin will make the caching decisions for infotainment users where latency is stringent. Meanwhile, due to limited storage capacity at the edge, one can use the cloud to cache the information that is needed less frequently compared to cached information at the edge. To control caching in the cloud, cloud twins can be used.

C. Deployment Approaches for Twins

- Comparisons of various twins depending on the deployment trends.
 - The table shows that edge-based twins (i.e., for multiple twin objects) have the highest robustness to failures compared to cloud-based twins and hybrid twins.
 - The elasticity of edge-based twins is higher than a cloud-based twin.
 - Mobility support for users and context awareness could be higher for edge-based twins due to the proximity of the end-devices.

